# HOW BILINGUAL PROGRAM HELPS STUDENTS IMPROVE THEIR COMMUNICATIVE COMPETENCE

#### Susie Kusumayanthi

English Education Program, Sekolah Tinggi Keguruan dan Ilmu Pendidikan (STKIP) Pasundan Cimahi, Indonesia

## Sisca Debora Stevanie

English Education Program, Sekolah Tinggi Keguruan dan Ilmu Pendidikan (STKIP) Pasundan Cimahi, Indonesia

Corresponding author: Susie Kusumayanthi, STKIP Pasundan

E-mail: susiekusuma7@gmail.com

Volume 5 Nomor 2 March 2021 Page 364-373

#### Abstract:

Bilingual program is a program that combines two languages, in this context are English-Indonesian, into a learning program in school. This bilingual program includes not only theory-based learning but also practice-based learning. Bilingual program can influence students in many ways, including in their communicative competence. The aim of this research is to find out that whether bilingual program can help students improve their communicative competence and how the students deal with it. Qualitative descriptive as the method of research and with observation, interviews, and document analysis/data analysis as the data collection techniques. This research shows that it is true that bilingual program can influence the students in their communicative competence. Based on this result, it can be concluded that bilingual program can help students improve their communicative competence with the programs held by school.

## **Keyword:**

bilingual program; bilingual education, communicative competence

Cite this as: Kusumayanthi, S. & Stevanie, S., D.,(2021). How Bilingual Program Helps Students Improve Their Communicative Competence,

https://doi.org/10.33197/ejlutama.vol5.iss2.2020.2655.4585

## **Article History:**

Received: 15 January 2021; Revised: 15 February 2021; Accepted: 25 March 2021



English is now known as the global lingua franca and as one of the world's most spoken languages by native and nonnative. Phillipson (2009) states that English, as a language, also plays a role in influencing other nations both linguistically and culturally (cited in Doiz et al., 2013). In this era, English is become important to learn. Indirectly, we are urged to study it because English has become a tool for communicating with the world. Without English, we would have difficulty communicating with other countries in every way.

We cannot deny that communication plays a dominant role in all aspects of life and the way to communicate is by learning the language. There is no age limit for learning a language. But research reveals that learning a foreign language is better from a young age and the place for them to learn English in school (Harley, 1986; Patkowski, 1990, cited in Amelia, 2016) English has been widely used in the state of education in schools, especially after we know that

English has been widely used in the state of education in schools, especially after we know that English is the language of international communication. At school, students can practice their English lessons by communicating with colleagues or teachers at their schools. This also led schools around the world, as well as in Indonesia, to integrate English as known as bilingual education into the school curriculum, so that students not only studying in their mother-tongue but also in English.

Bilingual education is one of the many ways for schools to educate their students in learning English, either as a foreign language or as second language. Bilingual education is not only designed for students who not speak English at all, but also for students who may be quite fluent





in English and it is hoped that this bilingual education will also enable students to become good English speakers or bilingual speakers in the future (Baker, 1993:9, cited in García, 2009). To support bilingual education, schools create their own bilingual program, adapting it to the school system. These bilingual programs are defined for both material programs and communication programs.

As previously mentioned, bilingual education is also related to improving student communication. Students who learn foreign languages, especially English, are expected to be able to communicate well in English. Bilingual education or bilingual programs in schools indirectly help students improve their communicative competence, not only at school but even at home too.

This is previous study whose research topic is somewhat similar to this research. The similarities between this previous study and this research are they both recognize that there is indeed a link between bilingual programs and communication competence in students who in this case are elementary school students. The difference between the previous research and this research is that the previous research conducted research in several classes with several samples of students and teachers.

Moreover, studies on how bilingual programs in an effort to improve students' communicative competence are rarely studied directly. Therefore, the goals of this study are finding out how bilingual program can help students to improve their communicative competence.

#### **METHODS**

This research is a qualitative descriptive research. For many disciplines, qualitative and descriptive research methods were common and increasingly used for teaching and learning second languages. For the study of second language classroom teaching, qualitative and descriptive research is well suited.

We need to observe how, in general, learning takes place or what factors it affects. A more indepth analysis of individual learners and their attitudes and experiences can be generated by qualitative research (Nassaji, 2015). Furthermore, Gall et al., (2003) stated that the goal of descriptive research is to describe a phenomenon and its characteristics. The subject of this research are the teachers and a student of bilingual class at a private elementary school in Cimahi.

In collecting the data, the researcher used observation, interview, and document analysis. The first is observation. Observation studies are defined as those that require the systematic documenting in a natural setting of visible phenomena or actions (Gorman and Clayton, 2005, p.40, cited in Baker, 2006). This can involve a school or other environment where language use is being researched in applied linguistics, such as a bilingual family home, etc. (Cowie & Richards, 2009). Patton (2001) also noted that observation is a method for analyzing participant actions from an open, inductive and holistic viewpoint – it is important to allow behavior to be viewed in a different way and new facets to be discovered from a framework not before described and researchers will literally analyze what is happening around them and provide them with valuable insights into the external dimensions of language education through observation (cited in Cowie & Richards, 2009)..

The second is interview. Potentially, interviews are the most qualitative study. The researcher may enter realities, such as subjective perceptions and behavior, which would otherwise remain unavailable by using interviews (Denzin & Lincoln, 2005, p.869). Patton (2001) defined interview as open-ended questions and probes yield in-depth responses about people's experiences, perceptions, opinions, feelings, and knowledge. Data consist of verbatim quotations with sufficient context to be interpretable. At least two goals can be fulfilled by notes. First, as the interview goes forward, notes will help the interviewer devise new questions. Second, notes on what is said will help to examine the recording itself later and to find relevant quotes (cited in Fraenkel et al., 2012) and for that reason, a mobile recording device is used for this interview.

The third is document analysis. Document analysis, both written and electronic (computer-based and internet-transmitted), is a standardized method used to analyze documents. There are different types of document that can be used to analyze (Bowen, 2009).

Merriam (2009) highlighted that documents of all types can help the researcher uncover meaning, develop understanding, and discover insights relevant to the research problem. Consequently, in this study the researcher will be analyzing some type of document such as researcher journals, student journals, syllabus, and transcripts of both-teacher and also student' interviews.

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The researcher asked a syllabus and a lesson plan from the teacher. The researcher also did the student observation and used observation field-notes as the researcher's journals, analysis student's weekly diaries, and also did the interview with the teacher, the headmaster, and the student.

#### Result

#### Results of Student Observation in the Researcher Journals

The research journals contain transcripts and notes during observing the participant when she communicates in English in natural settings or in other words, in this context, at the participant's home.

The research found out that the participant the participant could answer and respond well to any questions and words from the participant. The researcher could understand what the participant said and from the answers, the researcher also found that the participant understood the context of what the researcher was saying. Besides to researcher, the participant also can communicate well with participant's sibling who is indeed her sibling can also speak English. The participant can communicate in English in various contexts of conversation. It doesn't always have to be about school activities, but also about others.

In addition, the researcher also found that when communicating in English, the participant used good English vocabularies and each choice could be understood by the researcher. However, there are several times the participant used Indonesian. Not often, just a few sentences. But even so, she will come back to using English in her conversations.

#### **Results of Student Interview**

The interview with the student, as the participant, was conducted at her home while doing the observation so that there were not many questions asked. In this interview, the researcher asked several questions related to the participant's use of English, how she communicated with English, and also related what happened during the observation.

Table of Student Interview

Category	Coding
Bilingual Program Effects	English mastery
	Native-like fluency
Impacts of Bilingual Program on Communicative Competence	Indonesian as a tool of socializing
	Unsocialized
First-Language Barrier	Word
	Confusion
Influencing Factors	Reward and punishment
	Bilingual student

From the table, the researcher realized that there are effects of bilingual program such as English mastery, native-like fluency. As the participant mentioned that she feels more comfortable for

talking with English and because of that, she thinks Indonesian become weird for her. She more awkward if she talking with Indonesian.

The researcher also noticed that bilingual program also has impacts on communicative competence such as Indonesian as a tool of socializing for the participant and she did not socialize. The participant who acknowledges these impacts. She stated that Indonesian as her tool for socializing because all of her neighbors are speaking Indonesian and that also become the reason why a few years ago she did not socialize with her neighbors.

After the researcher analyze the interview, the researcher found that there is first-language barrier such in words and the participant also confused in some Indonesian words that she does not know the meaning. Due to of difficulties in some Indonesian words, the participant used translator application for help her.

The researcher also got the point that there are factors that affect the participant's communicative competence especially as the participant said that as well because the participant is the bilingual student so she is required to speak English at school and also her teacher reminded about the reward and the punishment if not speaking English.

The bilingual program also had impacts for students not only at school but also in their homes. Therefore, the researcher makes an outline that the bilingual program, in the school she is participating in, also influences the participant in communicating a lot. It can also be said that the bilingual program has a great impact on the participant, especially in communicating with people around her, including in her mother-tongue, Indonesian.

## **Results of Teachers Interview**

In interviews with teachers, the researcher focused more on asking questions about the bilingual program they used and how to implement it in the bilingual classroom.

Table of Teachers Interview

Category	Coding
Bilingual Program Concepts	Bilingual program combination
	Extra subjects in
	English
	Yearly exam
	Weekly plan
	Flipped learning
	English as language
	instruction
	Material differences
	Habituation
	programs
	Teacher-student
Practices in Class	cooperation
	Lesson plan
Measure/Evaluate	Assignment
Measure/Evaluate	Remedial
Misconception of Bilingual Program in Communicative Competence	Bilingual program expectations
Bilingual Program Rules	National exam
	Master both
	language
	Speaking English
Media in Bilingual Program	My Pals

Based on the table above, the researcher found out that in bilingual program concepts, there are bilingual program combination as the teacher mentioned that combines two curricula, national curriculum and the curriculum adopted from Singapore. Then there are extra subjects in English such as Sciences, Math, and English. This bilingual program also conducts yearly exam of Cambridge Assessment English (CAE).

In this concept, the program must focus on the weekly plan and use flipped learning as learning model so that the teacher provides the material the day before so students can learn it first. Then, the researcher also found that in the concept, English as language instruction and learning materials are different in the two curricula used. In practices, teacher-student cooperation is the most needed in class because as the teacher stated that learning can go well if there is cooperation between teacher with students and each learning is carried out according to the lesson plan.

The teacher also said that the assignment given to students was a way to measure students' progress and if students had not reached the expected standards, the teacher would hold remedial teaching and remedial test.

The researcher also realized besides that, there is also misconception in the bilingual program, especially in communicative competence. The teacher explained that many parents of students have the expectation that because of bilingual program, their child will immediately be at the certain point. But in reality, it cannot be like that in such a short time. The school has arranged the stages that students must go through in order to reach certain standards.

Even though this program emphasizes the use of English, school still have to follow the provisions of the national curriculum. As teacher mentioned, bilingual students still have to take national exams. In addition, students are also required to master the two languages they are learning, English and Indonesian. The teacher also pointed out that this bilingual program uses the My Pals book as a learning medium for bilingual class.

As well known, the basics of communicative competence in bilingual program is speaking English. Speaking English in this context means that students required to speak in English without being too worried or too focus on grammar of the sentences. The researcher highlighted the teacher statement about the most important thing in communicative is not the grammar but the message or context they convey can be understood by the interlocutor and vice versa, students understand what their peers say. Grammar is necessary but teachers should not force students to always use the correct grammar every time they speak.

The researcher noticed that school have an important role in implementing bilingual program at school. The school's role is to adjust the program that will be used for students. The teacher also has an important role because the teacher will carry out the bilingual program for students in classroom.

## **Results of Student's Weekly Diaries**

As mentioned above in teachers interview, from one of the bilingual programs mentioned, there is a weekly diaries program for students. The researcher also get data from weekly diaries. During the observation, the researcher found that it was true that the participant as the student wrote her weekly diaries every week and at the end of the week, the weekly diaries would be sent to the homeroom teacher.

After reading the participant's weekly diaries, the researcher found that the participant's English was quite good. It is said to be quite good because after reading it, there are still some deficiencies in the writing such as there are still many misspelled words, both in the lack of letters or vice versa. The participant also frequently repeat words in her weekly diaries. The use of tenses is also slightly wrong, but the rest is good.

Below is the table of the data error in spelling;

Table of The Data Error in Spelling

Error	Should Be
-------	-----------

breakfeast	breakfast
I dint	I didn't
for 4 ours	For 4 hours
watched church	watched worship online
kareoki	karaoke
tradisional market	traditional market
choclat flavored	chocolate flavor
lecy flavord	lychee flavor
3 hourse	3 hours
Horibel	Horrible
Triying	Trying
Rice flied	Rice field
Rembered	Remembered

As the researcher explained above, there were several errors in writing weekly diaries. The researcher found that it seems the participant write her weekly diaries based on the sound of the words. Therefore, it could be the participant just depend on how her pronounce it if she is required to write in English.

## Results of Syllabus and A Lesson Plan

#### a. Syllabus

The researcher found that the syllabus written under the title Annual Program. The syllabus from three addition subject; English, Sciences, and Math, are written in English and for class bilingual program, the syllabus would written by the homeroom teacher and the principal would approve it.

The annual program is quite detailed such as writing the name of the subject teacher in question, then there are also the total weeks in the semester, including the explanation about total effective weeks and total non-effective weeks. The annual program shows an estimate of the real effective weeks. Not only the real effective weeks, this annual program also shows an estimate of total effective hours. In total effective hours, it explains clearly what learning objectives bilingual students will study in one semester divided into several lessons. And there is also a mention of the total hours needed to complete this one lesson.

## b. An example of lesson plan

In addition to getting the syllabus, the researcher also gets an example of the lesson plans for the first semester of science subject. In this lesson plan written information about the class and semester that will receive this lesson with the unit being studied in this lesson plan. Then also mentioned time which is written with the number of periods that must be done. And mentioned the sources used to study the material.

Learning objectives written in the syllabus are also rewritten in the lesson plan. However, of all learning objectives in one lesson, one lesson plan only mentions one learning objective. From that one learning objective, the teacher, as those who make lesson plans, explains extensions activity that will be fulfilled to achieve this learning objective. In extensions activity, it describes the activities carried out, such as engage, explore, explain, elaborate, and finally, evaluate. In all these activities, each of them also states the objectives and resources of the activity and the time it will take to fulfill these activities.

#### **Discussions**

As has been mentioned this study was conducted to find out how bilingual program helps the student to improve their communicative competence. Therefore, this part discusses the summarizing of the data analysis in the finding and interpretation related to the finding. There are two points to be discussed they are; can bilingual program help the student improve their

communicative competence, and how bilingual program help the student improve their communicative competence.

Can bilingual program help the student improve their communicative competence?

Based on the findings that the researcher has described above, the researcher has found the answer to the first research question, can bilingual program help the student improve their communicative competence. The result is yes, it can. Bilingual programs can help students improve their communicative competence.

How bilingual program helps the student improve their communicative competence?

From the results above which have stated that the bilingual program can help students improve communicative competence, the researcher can relate these results to the answer to the second research question, how the bilingual program helps the student improve their communicative competence, and the results obtained by the researcher are the bilingual program which have been conducted in school. These things are obtained from interviews, observations, research journals, syllabus, along with an example of lesson plans.

The researcher found out that school combines national curriculum and the curriculum adopted from Singapore in bilingual program and because it adopts two different curricula, the learning materials will be different. Therefore, this program uses two languages as language instruction, Indonesian-English. That is provided by Andersson and Boyer (1970;12, cited in May (2017) who emphasized that bilingual education is instruction in two languages [emphasis in original] and the use of those two languages as mediums of instruction for any part or, or all, of the school curriculum.

As mentioned in the previous chapter (see chapter 2), that Garcia (2009, cited in Fitriarti, 2016) also stated such as those that use a second or a foreign language as an instructional medium; that is, bilingual education programs teach content in a language other than the home language of the children.

School also adding extra subjects in English such as Sciences, Math, and English, and this program also conducts yearly exam of Cambridge Assessment English (CAE).

In learning, the teacher focusses on weekly plan and uses flipped learning as model learning for students. The teacher mentioned that cooperation between teachers and students was needed in the classroom and in its implementation, the teacher would implement it according to the lesson plan. For measure students' progress, the teacher also said that the assignment given to students was a way to measure and if students had not reached the expected standards, the teacher would hold remedial teaching and remedial test.

As teacher informed that implemented programs in school are refer to habituation programs such as habituation of using English at school as well as in classroom, but also done during break or students free-time, also Weekly Diaries that students also required write their weekly diary and collected every week for improving their writing skill and also their vocabulary, Reading Habit in classroom so students get used to reading English book every day in the morning before lesson begin, Spelling Bee so the teacher will check students' spelling every week.

There is also Fun Time, a program that expected to be a fun program for students because they are free to talk to their friends and also to their teachers without discussing lessons but still using English, Video Project, called WednesPlus, held every Wednesday so the school will provide students with a different video project theme each week and the video will be uploaded by the school on the school's social media account. In the video project, they will present it in full English, and English competition so this competition is held to increase students' confidence in speaking because every student is obliged to take part in this competition so whether they like it or not, they have to keep participating.

As teacher mentioned, this bilingual program still has to follow the provisions of the national curriculum and bilingual students still have to take national exams. Students are also required to

master the two languages they are learning, English and Indonesian. The teacher also pointed out that this bilingual program uses the My Pals book as a learning medium for bilingual class.

As well known, the basics of communicative competence in bilingual program is speaking English. Speaking English in this context means that students required to speak in English without being too worried or too focus on grammar of the sentences. The researcher highlighted the teacher statement about the most important thing in communicative is not the grammar but the message or context they convey can be understood by the interlocutor and vice versa, students understand what their peers say. Grammar is necessary but teachers should not force students to always use the correct grammar every time they speak.

As Richard (1992:65, cited in Al-shamiry, 2020, p.447) stated that communicative competence as the capability to not only apply correct phrases in a language grammatically but also to know when and where to use these phrases and for whom. This was also confirmed by Hymes (1972) who stated that we have then to account for the fact that a normal child acquires knowledge of sentences not only as grammatical, but also as appropriate. He or she acquires competence as to when to speak, when not, and as to what to talk about with whom, when, where, in what manner. Goes along with it, the most important thing that must also be emphasized to help students improve their communicative competence is to allow students to speak freely even though there are errors in the language structure. As long as students know what context they are talking about.

Spolsky (1989) also agreed with that and he analyzed that in other words, Hymes pointed out the knowledge not that a sentence is well-formed but that it is appropriately used in a specific context.

Beside all that, there is misconception in the bilingual program, especially in communicative competence. The teacher explained that many parents of students have the expectation that because of bilingual program, their child will immediately be at the certain point. But in reality, it cannot be like that in such a short time. The school has arranged the stages that students must go through in order to reach certain standards.

The researcher also realized that school and teacher have important roles in bilingual program and also in students' communicative competence. School plays an important role in the habituation of students' English so that students can improve their communicative competence as well and also for adjust the program according to the needs of students in the school. The teacher also has an important role in applying programs for students in the classroom.

This is provided by Widdowson (2002) and he suggests that however, that no syllabus can generate communicative competence. Therefore, the educator who will be in charge of bringing this communicative syllabus into effect is responsible for the responsibility. In a second language, communicative competence could be based on the schema that children carry from their first language. The task of teachers is then to build on this expertise that has already been gained (cited in Suwanarak, 2014).

In addition to the researcher finding and proving that the bilingual program can indeed help students improve their communicative competence, the researcher also realizes other things during the study. In this case, it is during observations and interviews with students. The researcher found that, as said by the participants, she began to be confused in using Indonesian or in other words, her mother-tongue.

As the participant mentioned in the interview that she finds it a bit difficult to use Indonesian, she even sometimes has to use a mobile translator application to help her interpret Indonesian words that she does not understand. The fear of mispronunciation or choosing the wrong word also makes the participant less confident in speaking Indonesian so that she is more comfortable using English.

The researcher finally found that what the participant experienced was called language attrition. Based on Schmid (2011) language attrition defines the loss of, or changes to grammatical and other features of a language as a result of declining use by speakers who have changed their

linguistic environment and language habits. These changes can be caused by influences in the speaker's environment, as well as by his or her perceptions and processes of identification. So, it is realized by the researcher about what was experienced by the participant did exist and could happen.

However, the researcher could not explain the relationship between the bilingual program, communicative competence and language attrition because the research focus of this research was to find out how the bilingual program helps student improve their communicative competence.

## CONCLUSION

The purpose of this research is to find out bilingual program can help students to improve their communicative competence or vice versa and how bilingual program helps students improve their communicative competence.

Based on research, doing analysis, presenting findings and discussions, the researcher can conclude that bilingual program can helps student improve their communicative competence. This is proved by interviews with teachers and also with students as participants in this study. Documents that have been analyzed by the researcher such as interview transcripts, researcher journals, student's weekly diaries, syllabus, and an example lesson plan also help the researcher prove that bilingual program can helps student improve their communicative competence.

Bilingual program can help student improve their communicative competence, not only programs that are carried out during class hours which are written in the syllabus and lesson plans, but also programs that are implemented outside the classroom, such as getting used to speaking English outside class hours, making presentations in English with the video project, and also with English competitions.

Another thing that also encourages the bilingual program to helps student improve their communicative competence is by encouraging students' courage in speaking. That is because with courage, students can freely communicate. This is also encouraged by the bilingual program which indirectly forces students to dare to communicate in running the bilingual program that has been arranged by the school.

## REFERENCES

- Al-shamiry, R. A. M. (2020). Communicative Competence of the Saudi Learners of English at the Faculty of Languages and Translation , King Khalid University. Journal of Language Teaching and Research, 11(3), 446–461. https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.17507/jltr.1103.13
- Amelia, R. (2016). Benefits of Early Second Language Acquisition. Indonesian Journal of Integrated English Language Teaching, 2(1), 19–30. https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/81e9/a19aa8f2e0165bdbc7791e207a5ef0e4ba9e.pdf
- Baker, L. M. (2006). Observation: A complex research method. Library Trends, 55(1), 171–189. https://doi.org/10.1353/lib.2006.0045
- Bowen, G. A. (2009). Document Analysis as a Qualitative Research Method. Qualitative Research Journal, 9(2), 27–40. http://blog.powerdata.es/el-valor-de-la-gestion-de-datos/bid/405060/Qu-significa-la-integraci-n-de-datos
- Cowie, N., & Richards, K. (2009). Qualitative Data Collection Methods. In J. Heigham & R. A. Croker (Eds.), Qualitative Research in Applied Linguistics: A Pratical Introduction. Palgrave Macmillan.
- Doiz, A., Lasagabaster, D., & Sierra, J. (2013). Globalisation, internationalisation, multilingualism and linguistic strains in higher education. Studies in Higher Education, 38(9), 1407–1421. https://doi.org/10.1080/03075079.2011.642349
- Fitriarti, S. W. (2016). Safetalk Practices in Content and Language Integrated Learning (Clil) Classes. Language Circle Journal of Language and Literature, XI(1), 47–58.
- Fraenkel, J. R., Wallen, Norman, E., & Hyun, H. H. (2012). How to Design and Evaluate Research in Education (8th Ed., Vol. 7, Issue 2). McGraw-Hill.
- Gall, M. D., Borg, W. R., & Gall, J. P. (2003). Educational Research: An Introduction (7th Edition) (7th Editio). Allyn & Bacon.

- García, O. (2009). Billingual Education Policy: Frameworks and Types. In Bilingual Education in the 21st Century: A Global Perspective (1st ed., pp. 169–205). Wiley-Blackwell. http://gen.lib.rus.ec/book/index.php?md5=be76e2e631bfbd5ed9b398db86df4623
- Hymes, D. (1972). On Communicative Competence. J.B. Pride & J. Holmes (Eds.), Sociolinguistics.
  - http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=cat06300a&AN=sibbila.22851&site=eds-live
- May, S. (2017). Bilingual and Multilingual Education. Bilingual and Multilingual Education, January. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-02258-1
- Merriam, S. B. (2009). Qualitative Research: A Guide to Design and Implementation. Jossey-Bass. Nassaji, H. (2015). Qualitative and descriptive research: Data type versus data analysis. Language Teaching Research, 19(2), 129–132. https://doi.org/10.1177/1362168815572747
- Patton, M. Q. (2001). Qualitative Research & Evaluation Methods (3rd Ed.). SAGE Publications. http://books.google.com/books/about/Qualitative\_research\_and\_evaluation\_meth.html?id=FjBw2oi8El4C
- Schmid, M. S. (2011). Language Attrition. Cambridge University Press.
- Spolsky, B. (1989). Communicative competence and language proficiency testing. Applied Linguistics, 10(2), 138–156.
- Suwanarak, K. (2014). Bilingual Learning and its Effects on Students 'Communicative Competence. 3(1), 60–70.